



# Interagency Grizzly Bear Committee

## Winter Meeting Notes

December 11-12, 2018  
Holiday Inn Missoula Downtown, Missoula, MT



**Welcome & Introductions:** - IGBC Chair Matt Hogan asked for introductions around the table and the room and welcomed Executive Committee members and the public to the IGBC winter meeting at the Holiday Inn, Downtown Missoula.

Members and those representing Executive Members and Ecosystem Subcommittee Chairs present at the meeting include the following:

Matt Hogan, Martha Williams, Chris Boone, Chip Corsi, Pat Walsh, Bill Avey, Tim Woolley, Kate Norman, Chuck Mark, Karen Taylor-Goodrich, Chris Savage, Jeff Mow, Ken McDonald, Mary Farnsworth, Ben Conard and Peter McDonald.

IGBC Advisors Hilary Cooley, Scott Jackson and Frank van Manen, IGBC I&E Chair Kim Annis and IGBC Executive Coordinator Ellen Davis were also present.

**ACTION ITEMS/DECISIONS** (additional background information and details will follow below the decisions)

**Decision:** The IGBC standard winter meeting date has been changed to the first full week of December each year due to continued conflicts with the 2<sup>nd</sup> full week in December. The summer meeting remains the 3<sup>rd</sup> full week of June each year.

**Decision:** The Executive Committee is looking into a summer meeting retreat for the summer IGBC meeting. A working group of folks including Matt Hogan, Martha Williams (Ken McDonald), Pat Walsh, Frank van Manen, Mary Farnsworth and Ellen Davis will visit via teleconference to explore this idea further and come up with some recommendations. Ellen will initiate a "doodle" survey after the first of the year to schedule a conference call.

**Decision:** The following individuals will serve as advisors to the ecosystem subcommittees:

- The I&E Subcommittee representative from the ecosystem; and
- The leaders of the Yellowstone Ecosystem Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team (IGBST), the NCDE Science Team, the SCY Science Team, and the NCE Technical Team for their respective Ecosystem Subcommittees.
- A representative from the USFWS Grizzly Bear Recovery Office

**Decision:** Establish an IGBC Science Subcommittee

The membership, roles and responsibilities of the science team are as follows:

### Membership

- The leaders of the Yellowstone Ecosystem IGBST, the NCDE Science Team, the SCY Technical Team, the NCE Technical Team, and a representative from the Bitterroot Subcommittee;
- The U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service Grizzly Bear Recovery Coordinator
- The U.S. Forest Service National Carnivore Program Leader

## Roles & Responsibilities

### The role of the Science Committee include:

- Coordinate research across ecosystems;
  - Conduct cross-examination science as needed, contingent on funding and/or logistical support
  - Inform Executive Committee of ongoing research efforts on an annual basis;
  - Respond to requests for cross-ecosystem science from Executive Committee
- ### Role of the Chair

The Chair of the Science Subcommittee will rotate among ecosystems as determined by the Subcommittee. The Subcommittee will meet in person or via teleconference on an as-needed basis.

**Action:** Adding Department of Transportation (DOT) as advisory members is up to each ecosystem as warranted.

**Decision:** Ellen will facilitate a conference call with Hilary Cooley, Frank van Manen and Kim Annis (working group) to discuss emerging trends regarding conflicts and mortalities with bears and if/how subcommittees might address.

**Action:** The working group will develop a formal written request to the Subcommittee Chairs **by the end of January** asking them to identify those critical need areas and formulate some ideas and actions to be presented at the IGBC 2019 summer meeting. The subcommittee chairs will consult with their bear managers who specialize in bear management conflicts on the ground to help identify critical areas and needs.

## AGENDA TOPICS

### Update on Yellowstone Ecosystem Litigation, NCDE Delisting, & Administrative Rule Making for FWP – Hilary Cooley/Martha Williams

With the recent decision on the Yellowstone Delisting, cascading effects will be felt in the NCDE ecosystem in regards to moving forward on a decision whether or not to propose delisting that population. The NCDE ecosystem is biologically recovered.

U.S. District Court Judge Dana Christensen rejected the FWS decision to delist the Greater Yellowstone Ecosystem (GYE) grizzly bear population in 3 areas.

1. The Service violated the ESA under the standards set forth in the Administrative Procedures Act (APA) by delisting the Greater Yellowstone segment without analyzing the impact of delisting on other continental grizzly populations.
2. The Service's failure to require a recalibration provision in the Conservation Strategy is arbitrary and capricious.
3. The Service's determination that it need not provide for either natural connectivity or translocation is contrary to the best science available.

The Department of Interior is reviewing the court's decision on whether to appeal to the 9<sup>th</sup> U.S. Circuit Court of Appeals.

Wyoming Game & Fish has filed a Protective Order of Appeal in response to the U.S. District Court's recent decision.

The FWP Commission adopted an Administrative Rule to codify the demographic portion for the NCDE. The challenge for FWP is how to manage bears in the state of Montana.

**Public Comment**

Following the update on the Yellowstone Ecosystem delisting decision and the effects to the NCDE, Matt Hogan opened up the floor for public comment as follows:

Maggie Nutter, Livestock Association. Maggie emphasized the need to address safety issues in the delisting rule. She is concerned about livestock but more concerned with human safety. You can replace livestock but you can't replace a human life.

Mike Bader – Mike disputes the numbers for recovery. No habitat, no linkage, no recovery.

Sterling Miller – Sterling hopes the FWS appeals the recent ruling by Judge Dana Christensen on the Yellowstone Delisting. He is concerned about the large numbers needed for viable populations and how they undercut the smaller grizzly bear populations.

George Nickas, Wilderness Watch – George is concerned the IGBC committee is more focused on dotting the i's and crossing the t's and getting something through that the courts will approve. He believes we need to be putting our focus on social tolerance.

**Yellowstone Ecosystem Report** - Ken McDonald (see handout on IGBC website)

Motion made to approve Yellowstone Ecosystem Report, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion made, motion approved by IGBC executive committee.

**Interagency Grizzly Bear Study Team (IGBST)** – Frank van Manen

IGBST Update GYE Population Monitoring (see PowerPoint presentation on the IGBC website).

**Google IGBST to see additional information from this presentation or contact Frank van Manen.**

**NCDE Ecosystem Report** – Jeff Mow (see PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC website)

Motion made to approve the NCDE Ecosystem Report, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion made, motion approved by IGBC executive committee.

NCDE Population Trend & Mortality Report\_- Cecily Costello (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

**Selkirks & Cabinet-Yaak Ecosystem Report** – Ben Conard (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

Motion made to approve the SCY Ecosystem Report, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion made. The report is approved by IGBC executive committee.

**Augmentation & Research Update in the Cabinet Yaak & Selkirk Mountains** - Wayne Kasworm (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

Research captures not as successful as prior years.

2 bears caught in Washington State in the Selkirks

**Proposed Amendments to the IGBC Charter** – Chris Smith

Two amendments were proposed to the IGBC Charter for consideration by the Executive Committee (see description in decisions above). They include adding additional members as advisors to the Ecosystem Subcommittees and establishing an IGBC Science Subcommittee. The proposed amendments were sent to the executive committee for review prior to the IGBC winter meeting.

A motion was made to approve the IGBC amendments, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion was made, and the Executive Committee voted to approve the amendments.

Chris Smith will incorporate the changes into the IGBC Charter and send back to Ellen

**Bitterroot Ecosystem Report** – Chuck Mark

Chuck reported that the Bitterroot Ecosystem (BE) has a very active front country bear ranger program. The Bitterroot is also active in I&E programs and sanitation efforts. FWP and NGOs are doing great work with land owners in the Rock Creek area.

The bear that showed up at the Stevensville golf course greatly increased the interest in the spring Bitterroot ecosystem meeting at the Hamilton SO. An area of emphasis we need to work on in the BE is social acceptance.

Chuck asked the executive committee to help provide some guidance on where the BE goes from here. He would like to have some further in-depth discussion with some of the executive committee members for their input and perspective. How do we pick the Bitterroot Recovery Plan back up, continue our information, education and outreach efforts and open up dialogue with local and city governments? A note of interest, the 10J experimental population is still on the books.

**North Cascades Report FY17 and Program of Work FY18** –Karen Taylor Goodrich- (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

Scoping for the North Cascades EIS is done and we have a Draft EIS. We received 26,000 comments and participated in 70 outreach events. The EIS was put on hold immediately following the election but has gained momentum again following Secretary Zinke's recent press conference to restart the EIS process. We have begun to reassemble teams and funding to get the Final EIS written and a Draft Record of Decision (ROD) completed.

A motion was made to approve the North Cascades Ecosystem Report, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion was made, and the Executive Committee voted to approve the report.

**Overview of bear conflicts across the ecosystems and what is being done to minimize those conflicts** – Hilary Cooley (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

Hilary gave an overview of bear conflicts across ecosystems looking at the trends and patterns.

Chris Savage noted that the recovery criteria related to mortality is different within and outside recovery zones and would like to review. There are different standards within the Recovery Plan. The standards are lower within the recovery zone and higher outside the recovery zone. In the GYE and NCDE more on the outside less in the core. Need to have a strategic look with the technical team or bear management specialists. Response is critical. Need an informed strategic look at critical mortality

areas. Are we spending resources in the right areas? We need to be looking at trends and coming up with recommendations.

Cecily noted we need to be focusing on the new things we are seeing like agriculture bears. This is an issue that is challenging and often difficult to deal with.

**I&E Subcommittee Report** - Kim Annis (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

Kim gave an update on the I&E Subcommittee and highlighted the progress the group is making with their goals and objectives. She also presented the projects and recipients of the IGBC Funding (\$36K) for FY19 as follows:

<b>FY19 IGBC Information, Education &amp; Outreach Grants</b>		
<b>Project Name</b>	<b>Submitting Organization</b>	<b>Award Amount</b>
<b>All Ecosystems</b>		
Grizzly Bear Conflict Reduction Field Technician	Defenders of Wildlife	\$ 2,200
<b>Bitterroot</b>		
Bitterroot National Forest Front-Country Bear Ranger	Bitterroot NF	\$ 3,500
Lolo National Forest Bear Ranger	Lolo NF	\$ 1,500
<b>North Cascades</b>		
Grizzly Bear Outreach Project	Western Wildlife Outreach	\$ 3,000
<b>Selkirk</b>		
Colville National Forest Information Boards and Signs	Colville NF	\$ 1,900
Mountain Biking Sign Design	Idaho Panhandle NF	\$ 1,000
<b>Cabinet-Yaak</b>		
Ksanka Bear Ranger	Kootenai NF	\$ 2,740
Plains/Thompson Falls Bear Aware Education Materials & Salary Funding	Lolo NF	\$ 3,175
Human-Bear Conflict Reduction Through O & E in NW MT	Yellowston to Yukon Conservation Initiative	\$ 2,000
Coalition for Recovery:Community Engagement & Conflict Reduction in the CYE	Yaak Valley Forest Council Apple Festival	\$ 500
<b>Yellowstone</b>		
Promoting Human Bear Coexistence in Southwest Montana	Beaverhead-Deerlodge & Custer-Gallatin NF	\$ 5,000
Inert Bear Spray Project	Wyoming Game & Fish	\$ 1,000
Kiosk Information Posters	Bridger-Teton NF	\$ 1,000
<b>Northern Continental Divide</b>		
Ksanka RD Bear Ranger	Kootenai NF	\$ 2,740
Lolo NF Bear Ranger	Lolo NF	\$ 1,245
Ferndale & Condon Bear Fairs	Swan Valley Connections	\$ 500
Bridging the Gap – Living with Grizzly Bears Outside of the Recovery Zone Year 2	Helena-Lewis and Clark National Forest	\$ 3,000
		<b>\$ 36,000</b>

2019 Grants were reviewed and approved on December 4th, 2018

Any questions regarding IGBC Informationa & Education grants please contact Ellen Davis [ellendavis@fs.fed.us](mailto:ellendavis@fs.fed.us)

**Accomplishment Report & Program of Work** – Chris Smith, WMI (See PowerPoint Presentation on IGBC Website)

Chris gave an update on the accomplishments and program of work through the Challenge Cost Share Agreement WMI has with the FS/IGBC. The agreement initially began in 2011 for 5 years and then was renewed and approved for another 5 years in 2017. The IGBC contributes \$50K annually to the WMI for IE&O work.

A Motion was made to approve the I&E Subcommittee Report, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion was made and the report was approved by IGBC executive committee.

**IGBC Executive Committee Five-Year Action Plan Roles & Responsibilities** – Matt Hogan

The Executive Committee reviewed the Five-Year Action Plan roles and responsibilities for the group specifically looking at goals and actions for 2018 and updated accomplishments. Some actions are on-going or were carried over into 2019 for completion.

Chris Smith is tracking accomplishments and will update the current IGBC Five-Year Action Plan. The updated plan will be posted on the IGBC website.

A motion was made to approve the IGBC Executive Committee Roles & Responsibilities section of the Five-Year Plan, a 2<sup>nd</sup> motion was made, and the Executive Committee voted to approve the updated report.

**\*\*\*END\*\*\***